

# Teacher Performance Evaluation In Indonesian Schools: Implementation And Impacts

Ngasbun Egar<sup>1</sup>, Siti Musarokah<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup> (English Education Study Program, Universitas PGRI Semarang, Indonesia)

---

## Abstract:

**Background:** This study examines the implementation and effects of Teacher Performance Evaluation in Indonesia. Previous research on the topic has highlighted various challenges. Although many schools have adopted teacher evaluations, several obstacles remain, requiring prompt solutions. Both teachers and students stand to gain from the use of performance evaluations, as student responses to teaching quality have shown improvement as a result of these evaluations.

**Methods:** The research adopts a conceptual approach, reviewing existing literature, policy documents, and theoretical frameworks to assess the evaluation process and its impact on teacher performance, professional development, and student outcomes.

**Results:** Findings from various studies on teacher performance evaluation in Indonesia indicate that progress has been limited. Despite the widespread adoption of teacher evaluations in schools, significant challenges persist.

**Conclusion:** While teacher performance evaluations in Indonesia have produced some positive results, such as improvements in student engagement and teacher professional development, several issues remain. These include challenges with student behavior, teacher preparedness, and administrative inefficiencies, which prevent the evaluations from being fully effective.

**Key Word:** Teacher performance; teacher evaluation; implementation; impacts.

---

Date of Submission: 21-02-2025

Date of Acceptance: 01-03-2025

---

## I. Introduction

Teacher performance evaluation is one of the most critical activities in schools aimed at improving the quality of teaching. The evaluation process is carried out by supervisors, typically school leaders or administrators, and is designed to assess teachers' performance over a set period. The goal is to provide insight into how pedagogical, professional, personal, and social competencies can be enhanced. The evaluation seeks to identify the steps needed to improve teacher competencies. According to the Indonesian Minister of National Education, the evaluation of teacher quality is based on four key competencies: pedagogic, professional, social, and personality competencies<sup>1</sup>. These competencies, which teachers are required to demonstrate, have been refined and are now considered essential teacher competencies. Teachers are expected to display and adhere to these competencies through various activities, actions, and attitudes during their teaching and mentoring roles.

Given the importance of evaluating teachers' performance, many schools worldwide have adopted similar evaluation systems. For instance, in Malaysia, a country with diverse ethnic groups, the Tenth Malaysia Plan includes initiatives to enhance the teaching profession and produce top-quality teachers<sup>2</sup>. These initiatives include rapid promotion opportunities based on performance, systematic continuous professional development (CPD) for all teachers, and a more comprehensive performance management approach. Similarly, in the United States, where teacher evaluation poses similar challenges, extensive evaluation methods have been tested<sup>3</sup>. Michigan's state legislature, for example, enacted an educational bill mandating the evaluation of teacher effectiveness in all school districts. The U.S. has developed comprehensive teacher assessment models, such as the Framework for Teaching, created by Charlotte Danielson. This model emphasizes the importance of a robust teacher evaluation system, assessing teachers' performance based on a predefined set of standards, which are then converted into rubric descriptors<sup>4</sup>.

In Indonesia, a developing country in the Asian region, teacher performance evaluation is known as "Penilaian Kinerja Guru (PK GURU)"<sup>5</sup>. The purpose of this evaluation is not to burden teachers but to foster professionalism, as the quality of professional services plays a significant role in the dignity of any profession. The Teacher Performance Assessment evaluates the core tasks of teachers within the context of career development, rank, and position<sup>6</sup>. Additionally, teacher performance evaluation is conducted based on teachers' competencies, including their learning assignments, mentoring, and other tasks relevant to school functions.

"Teacher performance" refers to a teacher's ability to fulfill their responsibilities within a school setting. Another important measure of teacher performance is the ability to demonstrate the required competencies<sup>7</sup>. This definition aligns with the notion that teacher performance reflects the professional efforts of educators<sup>8</sup>. Professional teachers, who continuously engage with students, have a significant impact on the quality of education. Furthermore, "performance" is often tied to the interest in setting, achieving, and surpassing goals, especially for individuals in a work environment<sup>9</sup>. In essence, teacher performance represents a teacher's actions that demonstrate quality and professionalism in education.

Numerous studies have been conducted to explore various models or methods for evaluating teacher performance. For instance, a teacher competence assessment approach was created to provide a profile of teacher competencies, which is valuable for teachers' professional development and is independent of certification programs<sup>10</sup>. In this approach, both professional and pedagogical competencies are assessed. One such example is research investigating the implementation of teacher performance evaluation during learning monitoring activities at SDN 04 Duhiadaa in Gorontalo, Indonesia<sup>11</sup>. These examples of research aim to implement and refine instruments for evaluating teacher performance.

Building on these discussions, this conceptual-based article seeks to explore the implementation of teacher performance evaluation in Indonesia and its associated impacts. The findings are expected to shed light on how schools conduct teacher performance evaluations and the obstacles encountered in the evaluation process. By identifying these barriers, the study aims to provide insights that can lead to better preparation for future evaluations.

## **II. Material And Methods**

**Study Design:** This conceptual research investigates the implementation and impacts of teacher performance evaluation in Indonesian schools. The study is based on a thorough review of existing literature, policy documents, and theoretical frameworks to analyze the evaluation processes and their effects on teacher performance, professional development, and student outcomes. The research examines the essential role of teacher performance evaluation in Indonesian schools, with a focus on how it is implemented and the significant impacts it has. A comprehensive review of literature, policy documents, and theoretical frameworks allows for a rigorous analysis of the evaluation processes and their effects.

**Study Location:** This study was conducted in Indonesia, where teacher performance evaluation is implemented to enhance teachers' competencies and support professional development.

**Data Collection:** Data for this research were gathered from secondary sources, including government policies and regulations, academic literature, reports, case studies, and theoretical frameworks. The data collection aims to provide insights into the evaluation practices and their effects on the teaching profession in Indonesia.

**Data Analysis:** A thematic analysis was conducted to identify key themes, patterns, and gaps in the practices of teacher performance evaluation. The analysis is structured around the following areas:

- 1. Implementation Mechanisms:** This aspect examined how teacher evaluation systems are designed and implemented in Indonesian schools.
- 2. Impacts on Teachers:** This focused on investigating the influence of evaluations on teacher motivation, professional growth, and classroom practices.
- 3. Effects on Student Outcomes:** This explored the relationship between teacher performance evaluations and student learning achievements.
- 4. Challenges and Best Practices:** This section addressed the challenges encountered in the implementation of teacher performance evaluation and identifies successful strategies adopted by schools or regions to overcome these challenges.

## **III. Result**

### **Implementation of Teacher Performance Evaluation in Indonesia**

This article explores various studies on the implementation and development of teacher performance evaluations in Indonesia. A detailed review of these studies reveals both the successes and challenges in implementing such evaluations. The results from the studies highlight how teacher performance evaluation is carried out in different schools, the obstacles faced by teachers and schools, and the effectiveness of the evaluations. The findings are outlined as follows:

61016

The first study examined the implementation of teacher performance evaluation at SDN 04 Duhiadaa, Gorontalo, Indonesia<sup>11</sup>. The research indicates that the evaluation of teacher performance, particularly in the context of learning monitoring activities, was successful. The evaluation process encompassed planning and

executing lessons, as well as assessing learning outcomes. Teachers' performance was evaluated based on their instructional, professional, social, and personal competencies, and the overall score of the teacher performance evaluation was 4 (out of 5). This evaluation focused on the preparation for learning, core activities such as material mastery and the use of learning strategies, as well as reflection and follow-up at the end of lessons. Additionally, student feedback was solicited as part of the evaluation process because students' insights on teacher behavior were considered valuable. However, some challenges were noted, such as the potential for student evaluations to be biased, as students might collaborate to submit negative reviews of teachers they disliked.

In contrast, a study on the implementation of academic monitoring in SDN Kedunggempol, Mojosari, Indonesia, found that the teacher performance evaluation process was ineffective<sup>12</sup>. The evaluation was hindered by the teachers' lack of preparedness and the evaluators' insufficient readiness. The 2019 teacher performance report revealed that only less than half of the scheduled academic supervision was conducted. The principal's approach to academic supervision was outdated, and this contributed to the poor evaluation results. Despite teachers' qualifications and their ability to create well-structured lesson plans, some teachers still adhered to strict, teacher-centered instructional methods with limited use of diverse learning materials and media. This was a concern for both the students and the vice principal in charge of curriculum affairs.

Another study focused on self-evaluation models used to monitor English teachers' performance in Surabaya, Indonesia. The research involved forty English teachers from eighteen senior high schools in the city. These teachers were asked to voluntarily test self-evaluation models in their schools. The results showed that while supervisory checklists were used by school principals to monitor teacher performance in the classroom, many of the participants were not satisfied with the checklists as a tool for evaluation<sup>12, 13</sup>. This dissatisfaction indicates a gap in the current evaluation methods, as teachers felt that the checklists were not fully effective in assessing their performance.

On the other hand, as both the principal of the school and the head of the English department, investigated different models of self-evaluation to monitor the performance of language teachers in the classroom<sup>14</sup>. Participants in this study included forty English teachers from a total of eighteen senior high schools (abbreviated as "SMU") in the city of Surabaya. Most of these participants' academic qualifications were at the S1 or S2 level (95 percent and 62 percent, respectively) (5 percent). In addition, forty competitors were selected from 18 of the city of Surabaya's 146 senior high schools (also known as "SMU"), both public and private. These forty participants were each given an interview, and out of those two, they were requested to voluntarily test out the Teacher Self-Evaluation models in their respective schools. The result of the study shows that the supervisory checklists were used as a tool to evaluate the English teacher performance that the school principals monitored in the classroom; however, many participants did not feel satisfied with the checklists.

In summary, the implementation of teacher performance evaluation in Indonesian schools has shown mixed results. While some schools have seen positive outcomes, others face significant challenges, including lack of preparedness, outdated evaluation models, and dissatisfaction with existing evaluation tools. These findings highlight the need for further improvements in teacher performance evaluation systems in Indonesia.

### **Impacts of Implementation of Teacher Performance Evaluation in Indonesia**

The implementation of teacher performance evaluation in Indonesian schools has both positive and negative impacts on students, teachers, and the overall educational environment. The research highlights the various outcomes of these evaluations, which can be categorized into positive effects on student behavior, teacher motivation, and professional growth, as well as challenges that hinder the effectiveness of the evaluation system.

#### **Positive Impacts**

One of the most significant positive impacts of teacher performance evaluations in Indonesia is the improvement in student behavior<sup>11</sup>. Studies have shown that students exhibit more positive learning behaviors, such as paying attention, listening, and imitating the activities demonstrated by their teachers. These improvements in student behavior can be attributed to the increased effectiveness of teachers, who, after undergoing evaluation, are better equipped to engage their students. As teachers reflect on their performance, they are able to develop more effective teaching strategies, leading to a more engaging learning experience for students. Teachers also benefit from the evaluation process. The feedback they receive provides an opportunity for self-reflection, allowing them to identify areas for improvement. The evaluation system creates an environment where teachers can seek advice from school principals or colleagues, enabling them to develop new teaching techniques and address classroom challenges. This process promotes professional growth and development, helping teachers to continuously improve their teaching practices.

Additionally, teachers who are being evaluated demonstrate a positive attitude towards the process. Many teachers show enthusiasm during the evaluation process, as they are eager to improve their teaching methods based on feedback and guidance provided by the evaluation.

### **Negative Impacts**

Despite the positive impacts, there are several challenges and negative effects associated with the implementation of teacher performance evaluations. One of the main issues is the occurrence of negative learning behaviors among students<sup>11</sup>. In some cases, students may not pay attention, fail to imitate what the teacher demonstrates, or show disinterest in the lesson. These behaviors are often attributed to students' youthful tendencies to be distracted, but they can also be influenced by the teacher's instructional methods and classroom management skills.

Furthermore, some teachers, despite performing their tasks competently, lack a sense of responsibility and commitment to their role as educators. In some cases, teachers fail to prepare the necessary teaching materials before beginning the lesson, which impacts the quality of instruction<sup>8</sup>. This lack of preparedness can undermine the effectiveness of the teacher performance evaluation system.

The implementation of teacher performance evaluations also faces significant administrative and structural challenges<sup>13</sup>. One of the key obstacles is the lack of strong leadership in schools. Many school leaders fail to innovate and bring creativity to the evaluation process, opting for formal procedures that do not address the essence of effective teaching. The emphasis on completing administrative tasks, rather than conducting holistic evaluations, leads to a superficial approach to teacher performance assessment.

Additionally, some schools face a disconnect between teachers' instructional beliefs and their classroom practices. In particular, studies have shown that a significant number of certified English as a Foreign Language (EFL) teachers do not demonstrate effective strategies for engaging their students<sup>13</sup>. This misalignment between beliefs and practices contributes to a lack of positive rapport between teachers and students, which affects the overall learning experience.

Other challenges include a lack of adequate facilities, insufficient training in test item analysis, and frequent curriculum changes. These factors make it difficult for teachers to complete the necessary tools for teaching and assessment, which negatively impacts the teacher performance evaluation process<sup>15</sup>. Moreover, teachers who rely on repetitive and unvaried teaching approaches struggle to meet the evolving needs of students, which further limits the effectiveness of evaluations<sup>16</sup>.

In conclusion, while the implementation of teacher performance evaluations in Indonesia has led to positive outcomes in terms of student behavior and teacher professional development, significant challenges remain. To improve the effectiveness of these evaluations, schools need to address issues related to leadership, teacher preparedness, and the alignment of evaluation processes with the actual needs of students and teachers.

## **IV. Discussion**

The implementation of teacher performance evaluations in Indonesian schools has shown both positive and negative effects on students and teachers, as evidenced by various research studies. Evaluations play an important role in improving the quality of education by assessing teacher effectiveness, but there are also significant challenges that need to be addressed for the evaluation system to be more effective and impactful.

### **Positive Outcomes**

One of the main positive impacts of teacher performance evaluations is the improvement in students' attitudes and learning behaviors. As a result of more effective teaching methods, students are more engaged in learning activities such as reading, listening, observing, and imitating their teachers<sup>11</sup>. This increased engagement is attributed to the enhanced teaching strategies developed by teachers through the evaluation process. Teacher feedback helps identify areas for improvement, enabling educators to refine their methods and create a more conducive learning environment for students.

Another significant benefit of the evaluation system is the positive response from teachers. Many educators recognize the value of the performance evaluation process, as it offers opportunities for professional development. Through evaluations, teachers can receive constructive feedback from school principals, colleagues, and peers, which can help them improve classroom management and teaching techniques. Those who actively engage in the evaluation process tend to exhibit increased enthusiasm and motivation in supervising student learning, thereby improving overall educational outcomes.

### **Challenges**

Despite these positive impacts, several challenges have emerged in the implementation of teacher performance evaluations. One of the most significant issues is the persistence of problematic student behaviors<sup>11</sup>. While some of these behaviors, such as lack of attention and focus, are natural tendencies among younger students, they can also reflect gaps in teaching strategies and classroom management. Teachers who fail to adapt their methods to meet the needs of diverse learners may struggle to reduce these negative behaviors and enhance student engagement.

Another challenge lies in the commitment and preparedness of teachers. Research indicates that some teachers, despite being capable in their teaching tasks, lack a strong sense of duty and professionalism. Teacher performance is not solely based on skills but also on the degree of commitment and responsibility teachers show toward their roles. Teachers who fail to prepare adequately for lessons or neglect their professional duties may undermine the effectiveness of the evaluation system and hinder positive student outcomes<sup>7</sup>.

Administrative and structural challenges also contribute to the difficulties in implementing teacher performance evaluations. Weak leadership, lack of innovation, and an overemphasis on formality rather than meaningful improvements are issues identified in several studies<sup>12</sup>. Supervisors who fail to apply creative solutions to classroom challenges may reduce the evaluation process to a mere administrative task, instead of using it as an effective tool for professional growth. Moreover, inconsistencies in the implementation of teacher evaluations contribute to their limited success<sup>13</sup>. For example, only a small percentage of certified English as a Foreign Language (EFL) teachers effectively engage with their students, revealing a disconnect between teachers' instructional beliefs and their classroom practices<sup>15</sup>.

Additional challenges include insufficient facilities, inadequate training in test item analysis, and frequent curriculum changes, all of which complicate the evaluation process. Teachers who rely on repetitive, unvaried teaching methods may struggle to meet evolving student needs, reducing their ability to improve student engagement and learning outcomes<sup>16</sup>.

## V. Conclusion

In conclusion, the results of the investigation of several studies on teacher performance evaluation in Indonesia are still not going well. Although many schools have implemented teacher performance evaluations, there are still many obstacles that schools still have to face. A solution should be found immediately. The implementation of teacher performance evaluation has positive and negative impacts on the implementation of teacher performance evaluation in Indonesia, both for students and teachers. The positive impact of teacher performance evaluation is that there has been an improvement in how children act in response to the performance of their instructors. A positive attitude was also demonstrated by the teachers being evaluated. Demonstrating the existence of a teacher performance appraisal system by implementing teacher performance appraisals has demonstrated the existence of such a system. However, the difficulties that arose in implementing teacher performance evaluations led to negative impacts, which were felt by teachers and any parties who participated in the evaluation process. The parties are involved here: the students, the principals, the supervisors, the evaluators, and the school itself. The adverse effects that one school may have on another may vary; it is also possible that each institution faces some of the same challenges.

Therefore, stakeholders, which in this case would be principals or other school leaders, need to design and implement rules for evaluating teacher performance before deciding which methodologies are appropriate to be applied in schools. This must be done before deciding which methodologies are appropriate for schools. This policy determination can function as a point of reference to identify the path along which the school's goals will be formed. Because of this, schools require the development of a comprehensive and systematic evaluation. In addition, a culture of teacher competency development needs to be continuously developed to create an atmosphere of growth and development for both teachers and schools.

## References

- [1]. Regulation Number 16 Of 2007, Issued By The Indonesian Minister Of National Education
- [2]. Saleh, S., & Aziz, A. (2012). Teaching Practices Among Secondary School Teachers In Malaysia. *IPEDR*. 2012. V47. 14, 63–67. <https://doi.org/10.7763/IPEDR>.
- [3]. Gedik, S. (2016). Öğretmen Performanslarının Değerlendirilmesine Yönelik Kapsamlı Bir Girişim: Michigan Eyaleti ( ABD ) Örneği A Comprehensive Initiative For Evaluating Teacher Performance : The Case. April. <https://doi.org/10.17679/uefd.17102081>
- [4]. Lulupanda, E. M. Et Al. (2019). Evaluasi Kinerja Guru SMA Bersertifikasi Dengan Model Charlotte Danielson Di SMA Negeri. *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, Volume: 6, No. 1, Januari-Juni 2019, 11–24.
- [5]. Buku 2 Penilaian Kinerja Guru. (2016)
- [6]. Permeneg PAN And RB Number 16 Of 2009
- [7]. Muhammad, A., & Gusrianty. (2019). Pengembangan Aplikasi Penilaian Kinerja Guru Di Sekolah Menengah Pertama ( SMP ) Menggunakan Logika Fuzzy ( Studi Kasus : SMP Negeri 3 Mandau ). *Jurnal Mahasiswa Aplikasi Teknologi Komputer Dan Informasi*, Vol. 1 (1), 46–51. <http://www.ejournal.pelitaIndonesia.Ac.Id/jmapteksi/Index.Php/JOM/Article/View/391/335>
- [8]. Arman Et Al. (2016). The Effect Of School Supervisors' Competence And School Principals' Competence On Work Motivation And Performance Of Junior High School Teachers In Maros Regency, Indonesia. *International Journal Of Environmental & Science Education*, Vol. 11, No.15, 7309–7317.
- [9]. Mişu, S. I. Et Al. (2021). Determining Perceived Work Performance And Self-Efficacy Among High-School Teachers. *Journal Of Economics And Management Sciences*; Vol. 4, No. 2; 2021, <https://doi.org/10.30560/Jems.V4n2p15>
- [10]. Kuntarto, E., Et Al. (2019). Teacher's Competency Assessment (TCA) In Indonesia: A New Frame Work. 2nd International Conference On Educational Assessment And Policy (ICEAP 2019), 14, 8–20. <https://doi.org/10.26499/Iceap.V0i0.198>
- [11]. Abdullah, Y., Rahmawati, & Damhuri. (2020). Implementasi Penilaian Kinerja Guru Dalam Kegiatan Supervisi Pembelajaran Di SDN 04 Duhiadaa. *Tadbir: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 8(2), 88–105. <https://doi.org/10.30603/Tjmpi.V8i2.1294>

- [12]. Marnoko. (2022). Peningkatan Mutu Kinerja Guru Melalui Supervisi Akademik Di SD Negeri Kedunggempol Mojosari Menghadapi PKG 2020 (Solusi Perubahan Melalui Gabungan Model Supervisi Akademik Artistic Model Dan Cooperative Development Model). *Jurnal Pembelajaran Dan Riset Pendidikan*, Volume 2, Nomor 2, April 2022, <https://doi.org/10.28926/jprp.v2i2.35>
- [13]. Zulfikar, Z. (2021). Evaluating Certified Indonesian EFL Teachers' Performance: A Case Study In A High School In Aceh. *ELT Worldwide: Journal Of English Language Teaching*, 8(1), 60. <https://doi.org/10.26858/eltww.v8i1.19349>
- [14]. Widodo, S. (2015). Teacher Self-Evaluation Models As Authentic Portfolio To Monitor Language Teachers' Performance. *TEFLIN Journal - A Publication On The Teaching And Learning Of English*, 15(1), 91. <https://doi.org/10.15639/teflinjournal.v15i1/91-116>
- [15]. Wahjusaputri, S., Al Khuwarizmi, F. R., & Priyono, D. (2021). Online Learning Program Evaluation To Improve The Education Quality In Primary School. *AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 13(3), 1670–1679. <https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v13i3.659>
- [16]. Aimah, S. & Purwanto, B. (2019). Evaluating Teachers' Performance: A Need For Effective Teaching. *A Journal Of Culture, English Language Teaching & Literature*. Vol. 19 No.1; July 2019